

# Whither Pakistan?

Swat, Buner, Gojra, Mukhtaran mai,  
Hina's office murder----a continuum-

# Four failures

- Failed state
  - Failed society
  - Failed policy
  - Failed intellect
- 
- How? Who? Needs debate
  - But we do not even have forums for that?

# Failed state

- Apologists will say cars run.....
  1. State has no monopoly on violence
  2. No property rights
    - Qabza
  3. No justice
    - Gojra
    - Hina etc
- State is the biggest predator--- serves elite--rentseeking
- Too many games played by the state
  - No one believes Masood dead

# Failed society

- Fragmentation
  - Clan, religion, tribe----looking for the door
- Newspapers full of despair
- “Today failure is the most often heard expression in Pakistan.” Roedad News aug 11
- “Pakistan is a dream turned sour, very few will disagree.” Tayyab Siddiqui nation Aug 4

# Social capital: What ordinary folk think---98 immigrants Dubai?

Percent

Proud of being Pakistani	16
Pakistanis are at fault	72
Work together	22
No Trust	69
Faith in state	12
faith in leadership	7

# Failed Policies

- Wunderkind PM croaked success
- Musharaf “in line of fire” strutting about
- All donor agencies congratulatory
  - Some macro and a burst of growth
- Governance
- Justice system
- Democracy
- The world (donors) happy.....congratulatory



# Failed intellect

- No thought leadership---research thinking—systematically destroyed
- No technocracy---No local debates ...no local visions
- No professionalism --Bankers for economists...Army officers for running universities
- All policy made by donors—no responsibility  
SAP, IPP FCD etc

# Social protection---perfect

- Of the elite
- Civil servant perks 14% of expenditures
- Clubs, golf courses, polo elite education subsidized
- Subsidies---PM and President travel 4b
- Prime land for rich and rich entertainment
- Poor condemned way out
- **Apartheid!?!?**

# The poor

- Excluded
  - Charity
  - No opportunity
  - No space
- 
- “The regal manner in which the rulers have treated themselves at the tremendous expense of the misery of the ruled is most depressing.”  
The Nation

# Youth

- 90m under 20
- No education
- No skills
- No opportunity---No hope
- No space—not even public or community
- No intellectual guidance...no domestic thought leadership
- **Except Mosque and Moulvi**

# What do you expect?

- Will they not come?
- Is John Perkins right?
- But what is the objective?
- Without a new approach....shudder

# What new approach

- Build society
- Build state—ghani and Lockhart Alavi
- Build community
  
- Let local intellect and debate lead
  - Ownership and local relevance