

2020 Vision Seminar *****Action for the World's Poorest and Hungry*****

Policy Responses to the Spatial Concentration of the Poorest in Lagging Regions: Looking to Latin America

Maximo Torero m.torero@cgiar.org







Source: POVCAL, based on household surveys





Source: POVCAL, based on household surveys



Changes in per capita Income and Inequality, selected countries

(Circa 1990, 1995 and 2000)*



•Years for each country. Argentina: 1992, 1996, 2001; Bolivia: 1991, 1997, 1999; Brazil: 1990, 1995, 2001; Chile: 1990, 1996, 2000; Colombia: 1991, 1995, 2000; Costa Rica: 1990, 1996, 2000; Dominican Republic: 1989, 1996, 2000; Guatemala: 1989, 1998, 2000; Honduras: 1990, 1996, 1999; Jamaica: 1990, 1996, 2000; Mexico: 1989, 1995, 2000; Nicaragua: 1993, 1998, 2001; Panama: 1991, 1995, 2000; Peru: 1990, 1996, 2000; Paraguay: 1990, 1995, 1999; El Salvador: 1989, 1995, 2000; Uruguay: 1989, 1996, 2000; Venezuela: 1989, 1995, 2000.

Source: POVCAL, based on household surveys.



An example of spatial concentration of the poorest















Is there really no improvement?

Sahn and Younger (2006) find evidence that despite increasing income inequality, nonincome dimensions of well-being (child's height and young women's education) have improved in Latin America over the last 20 years.

Sahn, David E., and Stephen D. Younger (2006). "Changes in inequality and poverty in Latin America: Looking beyond income to health and education", *Journal of Applied Economics*, *9 (2): 215-233*.



What are the possible types of Assets over which interventions can take place?

Asset	Examples	Mobility
traditional infrastructure	Transportation, water, sewer systems, irrigation, electricity, etc	Fixed
<u>human-capital & Labor</u>	schooling and health services, labor programs, reverse discrimination, etc.	Mobile
<u>Land</u>	Settlement schemes, land reform, transmigration of landless, property rights, yield related technology	Fixed
<u>social capital</u>	potentiated social networks through telephone, internet, etc.	Quasi-mobile with Network Externalities



A typology of Programs to alleviate poverty and inequality

Type of Program Interventions by objectives	Examples
Protection for vulnerable groups	 <u>Transfers</u> ✓ Cash transfers ✓ Near cash (food stamps, rations, etc) ✓ Food based (school feeding, mother and child health, supplemental feeding, etc) <u>Price and tax subsidies</u> (food, utilities, etc)
Managing risk (income generating)	Public-works, labor programs, etc
Managing risk (growth enhancing)	Conditional cash transfers, fee waivers for health and education, microfinance, productive projects, property rights, etc
Improving well-being	Access to utilities, housing
Types of program interventions by target group	Life cycle approach, special groups



Summary findings on conditional cash transfer programs

- The recent literature has focused almost exclusively on conditional cash transfer programs, with an **overall consensus that these programs have been mostly** successful in achieving their core objectives.
 - (Morley & Coady (2003), Attanasio et al. (2006), Handa and Davis (2006), Das et al. (2005)).
- There exists some evidence in favor of the **cost-effectiveness of CCTs compared to supply-side programs**
 - (Morley & Coady (2003), Caldés et al. (2006), Coady and Parker (2004)), but others remain skeptical (Handa and Davis (2006)).
- Exclusive focus of CCTs on human capital accumulation misses the broader context of poverty alleviation programs within rural development, **crowding out programs oriented to productive activities**,
 - (Handa and Davis (2006)).
- By targeting children of school age and leaving out infants, CCTs have less horizontal efficiency than other programs.
 - (Barrientos and DeJong (2006)).



Summary findings on microfinance and titling interventions

With respect to Microfinance

- Evidence suggests that they are **mostly ineffective in reaching the core poor**, but might help reduce poverty by reaching the better-off poor or potential micro-entrepreneurs (Weiss and Montgomery (2005)).
- Consistent with the **role of microfinance institutions as a vehicle for the development of the micro-enterprise** sector in Latin America, rather than the role as a tool for the removal of core poverty in Asia.

With respect to institutional arrangements: for example titling and property rights

- *First channel risk of expropriation*: Some impact in Field 2005.
- Second channel is gains from trade of land: Clear gain in value of the plot (Torero&Field; 2006 and Galiani et.al;2006)..
- *Third channel is Collateral and Credit Markets*: No impact. Titles is not enough, we need to look into information asymmetry and the supply side (Field and Torero; 2005 and Galiani et.al; 2006)
- *Provision of Public Goods at the level of the Neighborhood:* No clear impact (Torero & Field; 2006)



Summary of Findings on labor market impacts of job training programs

Country	Methodology	Employment rate	Formality	Wages
Argentina	Quasi-experimental, four rounds	0% - 11%, 10-30% for youngest (<21)	0% - 3%, 6% - 9% for youngest in one cohort	No significant pattern
Chile	Quasi-experimental, one round	18-22% larger for youngest groups	15-23% larger for youngest groups	22-25%, imprecisely estimated
Dominican Republic	Experimental, one round	None, higher (5-6%) but not significant in the East & Sto Dom	Health insurance 9% higher for men (43% vs 34%)	17% (marginally significant), larger for males under 19
Mexico	Quasi-experimental, six rounds	Overall, no clear pattern; on-the-job training robust positive effects (12- 30%)	Positive effects (10-20%) since 2002	No consistent patterns, at best small and mostly not significant
Panama	Natural experiment, one round	Overall not significant 10-12% for women and in Panama City	Overall not significant, probably higher outside Panama City	Overall negligible, large for women (38%) and in Panama -25%
Peru	Quasi-experimental, five rounds	Large, 13% (much higher for women)	Large: overall 11%, 14% women, and 5% men.	12 - 30% Heterogeneity in response to training quality

Source: Ibarraran, Pablo and David Rosas. 2006. IDB's Job Training Operations: Thematic Report of Impact Evaluations, OVE



Projoven: Training Quality and Monthly Earnings 1996-2003



Note: Pooled means are unweighted. The quality index is constructed by using first principal component of factor analytic methods.

Source: Chong, Alberto and Jose Galdo. Training Quality and Earnings: The Effects of Competition on the Provision of Public-Sponsored Training Programs. IZA 2006



Summary findings in terms of targeting strategies

- Evidence from poverty maps in Ecuador shows the **poor are geographically concentrated in that country**, particularly in the central Andean region, supporting geographic targeting (Elbers et al. (2007), Farrow et al. (2005)).
- Coady (2006) finds that geographic targeting dominates demographic and household proxy-means targeting in the case of *PROGRESA* in Mexico.
 - However, differences in implementation play a crucial role in the success of reaching the poor (Coady et al. (2004)).
- Evidence from Peru indicates that the choice of geographic targeting indicator might not have an important bearing on poverty outcomes (Schady (2002)).
 - Community-based decision makers may play a more important role in the degree of overall targeting of poor individuals than the central government's choice of districts (Stifel and Alderman (2005)),
- There is also evidence that **demand-driven programs compare well with other programs in reaching the poor** (Van Domelen (2002))



Two possible ways to go

- Identifying areas where different types of interventions could be maximized:
 - Market efficiency gap
 - Real access gap
- Maximizing complementarities of interventions



Market efficiency versus real access gap







Type of Program Intervention s by objectives	Examples
Protection for vulnerable groups	 <u>Transfers</u> ✓ Cash transfers ✓ Near cash (food stamps, rations, etc) ✓ Food based (school feeding, mother and child health, supplemental feeding, etc) <u>Price and tax subsidies</u> (food, utilities, etc)



Type of Program Interventions by objectives	Examples
Managing risk (growth enhancing)	Conditional cash transfers, fee waivers for health and education, microfinance, productive projects, property rights, etc.
Improving well- being	Access to utilities, housing



Type of Program Interventions by objectives	Examples
Managing risk	Public-works,
(income	labor programs,
generating)	etc

Asset complementarities: a real life example

"...Otro reclamo es que tome en cuenta la realidad. No se había enterado de que el pueblo de Los Organos, a cuyo colegio donó once computadoras y un televisor sólo tiene corriente eléctrica dos días a la semana, y eso, por horas...."

Revista Caretas, 08 de noviembre de 2001, N° 1695

"... Another claim is that the President should take into account reality. He had not found out that the town of 'Los Organos' to whose school he donated eleven computers and a television only has electricity two days a week, and on those days, just a few hours...."

Caretas, weekly Magazine. November 8th, 2001.



El Ministerio de Educación aculo de ponet en marcha el Plan Heavarin, La Ropública, es su afin de confiniter aportande al exclaminimiente de este promisio edacativa, conversé con el ritarador Mel Veiller Tuñota palen for vicennisity de Educación durante el pobleran de transicila y actualmente es directivo de Foro Educativo.

TITO REARIADEZ A.

presidente pe la Repu tirca, en el centra edeca-tivo de Haacrapuquia, pre-idió el acta de Lanzamienta e Russcarie, ¿Qué sig-Me fiene este acoste-

lar un progra-nestva incorpà-tao da mierras into de lim per cativos de la

taridades del gabier-eclarado que es un las de gran impacts social livaments, sete n está concebido en nr

月日()

idad educativa?

e ha informado que la 00 centros educativas.

to educative de Haser-spagae, el presidente Aleperdo: Tolodo poro en es obtendado como tina de las actorios esta francesidentales de la pobleme que atiendes aproximada-mente a dos millones de alumnos, ingresen, de gradual, a redes educativas, portales poda-pígicos y servicios de edua distancia, dondo lies tocnológicos e iticos permitan a

salieros, dosarrollar capa-cidades y actitudes peru-operar computadoras, in-gresar a Internet, usar codad advestig utilizar pregranuas educa tives y de productividad. Si rate es así en la reali-dad, naturalmente que este plan contribuirà

Es una demanda educativa que trasciende

a un periodo de gobierno, afirma experio

itan elucativa. ¿Cons debe gestineares este proyecto? Considero particularente que el Ministerio da Educación hace him en di-señar e iniciar la escución del Proyecto H

nento de la cali

El Plan Huascarán debe ser política de Estado

> dei Pian Piloto de Educa ción a Distancia, que me

Final remarks

- One size does not fit all, what works under one environment not necessarily will work in another, it will need to be adjusted
- The optimal program could be an optimal mix of programs according to differentiated needs
- Institutional and political economy environment matters

